

This is the peer reviewed version of the following article:

The impact of heat waves on daily mortality in districts in Madrid: The effect of sociodemographic factors.

López-Bueno, J. A., Díaz, J., Sánchez-Guevara, C., Sánchez-Martínez, G., Franco, M., Gullón, P., Núñez Peiró, M., Valero, I., & Linares, C. (2020). The impact of heat waves on daily mortality in districts in Madrid: The effect of sociodemographic factors. *Environmental research*, 190, 109993.

which has been published in final form at:

<https://doi.org/10.1016/j.envres.2020.109993>

1 The Impact of Heat Waves on Daily Mortality in Districts in Madrid: The Effect of  
2 Sociodemographic Factors.

3 López- Bueno JA<sup>1</sup>, Díaz J<sup>1</sup>, Sánchez-Guevara C<sup>2</sup>, Sánchez-Martínez G<sup>3</sup>, Franco M<sup>4,5</sup>, Gullón P<sup>4</sup>,  
4 Núñez Peiró, M<sup>2</sup>, Valero I<sup>2</sup>, Linares C<sup>1</sup>

5

6

7 <sup>1</sup>Escuela Nacional de Sanidad, Instituto de Salud Carlos III

8 <sup>2</sup> Escuela Técnica Superior de Arquitectura. Universidad Politécnica de Madrid

9 <sup>3</sup>The UNEP DTU Partnership. Copenhagen, Denmark.

10 <sup>4</sup> Public Health and Epidemiology Research Group, School of Medicine and Health Sciences,  
11 Universidad de Alcalá, Alcalá de Henares, Madrid, Spain.

12 <sup>5</sup> Department of Epidemiology, Johns Hopkins Bloomberg School of Public Health, Baltimore,  
13 MD, USA.

14

15 Corresponding Author:

16 Dr. Julio Díaz Jiménez

17 Escuela Nacional de Sanidad. Carlos III Institute of Health.

18 Avda Monforte de Lemos 5.

19 280209 Madrid

20

21

22 Abstract

23 Although there is significant scientific evidence on the impact of heat waves, there are few  
24 studies that analyze the effects of sociodemographic factors on the impact of heat waves  
25 below the municipal level. The objective of this study was to analyze the role of income level,  
26 percent of the population over age 65, existence of air conditioning units and hectares (Ha) of  
27 green zones in districts in Madrid, in the impact of heat on daily mortality between January 1,  
28 2010 and December 31, 2013. Seventeen districts were analyzed, and Generalized Linear  
29 (GLM) Poisson Regression Models were used to calculate relative risks (RR) and attributable  
30 risks (RA) for the impact of heat waves on mortality due to natural causes (CIEX:A00-R99). The  
31 pattern of risks obtained was analyzed using GLM univariates and multivariates of the binomial  
32 family (link logit), introducing the socioeconomic and demographic variables mentioned above.  
33 The results indicate that heat wave had an impact in only three of the districts analyzed. In the  
34 univariate models, all of the variables were statistically significant, but Ha of green zones lost  
35 significance in the multivariate model. Income level, existence of air conditioning units, and  
36 percent of the population over age 65 in the district remained as variables that modulate the  
37 impact of heat wave on daily mortality in the municipality of Madrid. Income level was the key  
38 variable that explained this behavior.

39 The results obtained in this study show that there are factors at levels below the municipal  
40 level (district level) that should be considered as focus areas for health policy in order to  
41 decrease the impact of heat and promote the process of adaptation to heat in the context of  
42 climate change.

43 Key words: Heat waves, income level, green zones, air conditioning, seniors 65 and over,  
44 adaptation.

45

46        **1. Introduction**

47        According to forecasts of the IPCC (IPCC, 2013), heat waves will become more frequent and  
48        intense, with increasing average temperatures already above 1°C at the global level compared  
49        to the preindustrial era (WMO, 2019). In the case of Spain, it is expected that in an  
50        Representative Concentration Pathway (RCP) 8.5 scenario for the 2021-2050 period, average  
51        maximum daily temperatures will reach 30.3°C in the summer, and 33.6°C later on in 2051-  
52        2100. There will be increases of 1.6°C and 4.9 °C respectively, compared to the reference  
53        period of 2000-2010 (Díaz et al., 2019). This horizon supposes an important increase in  
54        mortality attributable to heat if there are no processes of adaptation to heat, in addition to a  
55        significant increase in healthcare expenditure (Díaz et al., 2019). Adaptation to this rate of  
56        temperature increase is a challenge for health systems and requires knowledge about which  
57        variables most influence adaptive processes (Sheridan et al., 2018; Martínez et al., 2019;  
58        Linares et al 2020). On its own, biological adaptation to increasingly high temperatures is  
59        insufficient in the face of the temperature increases mentioned (Follos et al, 2020).

60        However, what is clear is that there is a process of population adaptation to higher  
61        temperatures that is taking place , as shown by the decrease in the effect of heat on mortality  
62        (Díaz et al., 2018; Barreca et al.2016; Wang et al. 2016). Also, it seems to be greater in the  
63        countries of southern Europe compared to their northern neighbors (Ward et al., 2016). In  
64        addition, the increase in minimum mortality temperatures that has been found in some places  
65        seems to point in the same direction (Mirón et al., 2008; Astrom et al., 2016 & 2018; Chung et  
66        al., 2017; Follos et al., 2020).

67        One of the principal factors that is known to influence the greater or lesser impact of heat on  
68        mortality is the number of people over age 65 (Montero et al., 2012; Díaz et al., 2015a;  
69        Gronlund et al., 2016), due to the aggravation of prior circulatory and respiratory (Díaz et al.,  
70        2002) as well as renal conditions (Gasparrini et al., 2015). Recent research also finds an

71 increase in mortality due to heat in terms of the aggravation of neurodegenerative diseases  
72 and mental health (Linares et al., 2016; Trombley et al., 2017).

73 In addition to what has been mentioned above, there are different processes that could  
74 explain this gradual adaptation to heat (Sheridan et al., 2018; Martínez et al., 2019; Follos et  
75 al., 2020). Some are social in nature, such as the so called “culture of heat” (Bobb et al., 2014).  
76 This term refers to the preventive measures carried to prevent the effects of extreme high  
77 temperatures. These measures consist on the extensive heat–health warning systems and  
78 public health response programs have been implemented in several U.S. cities. These  
79 programs often contain specific measures targeted toward the elderly population, which could  
80 be one reason why heat-related mortality declined most rapidly for the oldest age group,  
81 others are related to the health system as in the existence of prevention plans (Linares et a.,  
82 2015; Ebi & Rocklov 2014) or improvements in health services (Mirón et al., 2015), and some  
83 seem to be related to architectural and urban factors (Fisk, 2015). Thus, some studies show  
84 how the age of buildings can explain the distribution and intensity of the risks associated with  
85 temperature (López-Bueno et al., 2019; Loughnan et al., 2015). In this sense, variables such as  
86 proper insulation in housing or energy efficiency of buildings are important (Willand et al.  
87 2016), as well as the existence of air conditioning units (Martínez et al., 2019; Díaz et al.,  
88 2018). Furthermore, urban planning factors such as the presence of green zones and reduce  
89 the heat island effect (Bowler et al., 2010; Burkart et al., 2016; Norton et al., 2015; Lee et al.,  
90 2016).

91 Also related to these factors are issues such as income per household (Laverdière et al., 2016;  
92 Mushore et al., 2018; Phung et al., 2016), because it conditions the use of air conditioning  
93 systems, which play a central role in mitigating the impact of heat waves on health (Barreca et  
94 al. 2016; Fisk, 2015; Guirguis et al., 2018; Laurent et al., 2018; Loughnan et al., 2015; Zhang et  
95 al., 2017). Also, households with low income levels have difficulties in repairing and improving

96 living spaces, and income can also determine the levels of health and healthcare services of  
97 those who are vulnerable.

98 Although there are many studies that delve into these areas with respect to the impact of heat  
99 on a city (Díaz et al., 2015b; López-Bueno et al., 2019), on a country (Barreca et al., 2016) or on  
100 multiple countries (Guo et al., 2018), there are few that approach the problem at a level below  
101 the municipal level and that focus on possible heterogeneity that can exist at the level of  
102 different districts (or neighborhoods) within a city. Neighborhoods can be characterized by  
103 large differences at the socioeconomic and demographic levels as well as in terms of urban  
104 planning and infrastructure. Knowledge of how these variables can modulate and determine  
105 the impact of high temperatures is crucial in order to guide the development of policies that  
106 aim to mitigate the consequences of heat on the health of the population.

107 The objective of this study is to analyze the impact of heat waves on different districts in  
108 Madrid during the 2010-2013 period and to study whether variables such as income, the  
109 percentage of the population over age 65, access to cooling systems and the hectares of green  
110 zones in each zone explain the different behavior of the impact of heat on daily mortality.

111

112        **2. Materials and methods**

113        The analysis strategy has followed two phases. In a first stage, an ecological, longitudinal  
114        retrospective time series analysis was carried out to analyse the impact of heat waves on daily  
115        mortality in different districts of the city of Madrid, by calculating relative risks (RR) and  
116        associated attributable risks (AR) between January 1, 2010 and December 31, 2013.

117        In the second stage, Binomial models were conducted to investigate if the variables of social  
118        context influence the relation in the pattern of risks found. Therefore, the results of both  
119        phases are examined together in order to analyse whether the previous results found at the  
120        district level using RR and RA could be explained by variables related to the social,  
121        demographic and urban context, such as income level, the percentage of the population over  
122        age 65, the access to cooling systems, and hectares of green zones in each district. Univariate  
123        models were constructed first and supported later multivariate models to determine those  
124        models with the final, statistically significant variables.

125

126        **2.1 Calculation of relative risks and attributable risks associated with heat waves**

127        Generalized Linear Models (GLM) of the Poisson family were used to determine the existence  
128        of risks associated with extreme heat events as follows:

129        **2.1.1 Variables**

130        The dependent variables used were annual aggregated data on daily mortality due to natural  
131        causes (CIE X: A00 – R99) by district. This data were provided for "Instituto de Estadística de la  
132        Comunidad de Madrid" and aggregated by "Madrid Salud" (Council of Madrid City).

133        The districts of Madrid are pictured in Figure 1. Of them, districts 14, 18, 19 and 21, which  
134        correspond to Mortalaz, Villa de Vallecas, Vicalvaro and Barajas, respectively, were discarded  
135        for having more than 10 percent missing data.

136 The independent variable considered was heat waves, or Theat, quantified based on data for  
137 maximum daily temperatures measured in the observatory of reference in Madrid-Retiro from  
138 the State Meteorological Agency (AEMET).

139 The variable Theat is defined in the following way:

140  $\text{Theat} = T_{\text{max}} - 36$  when  $T_{\text{max}} > 36^{\circ}\text{C}$

141  $\text{Theat} = 0$  when  $T_{\text{max}} \leq 36^{\circ}\text{C}$

142 The maximum daily temperature of  $36^{\circ}\text{C}$ , is the daily threshold temperature, at which  
143 mortality due to heat begins to increase in the municipality of Madrid, according to prior  
144 studies (Carmona et al., 2017). As the effect of heat manifests in the short term, lag variables  
145 were introduced for the variables Theat of up to for days (Díaz et al., 2015b). Also included  
146 were the values of average relative daily humidity. Other control variables included in the  
147 models were series trend and seasonal components and the autoregressive nature of the  
148 series. Only an autoregressive of order one was used to control the autoregressive nature of  
149 the daily mortality series in the Poisson models. The reason for including only the  
150 autoregressive of order 1 focus on previous studies conducted (Alberdi et al., 1997).

#### 151 2.1.2 Calculation of relative risks and attributable risks

152 The modeling of the Poisson regression allowed us to obtain the relative risks (RR) associated  
153 with the variable Theat and the lags that were statistically significant in relation to daily  
154 mortality in each district analyzed. Based on the values of RR, population attributable risks  
155 (PAR) were calculated using the equation:  $\text{RA} = (\text{RR}-1/\text{RR}) * 100\%$  (Coste and Spira, 1991). This  
156 process was repeated for each district. The models were adjusted using a backward stepwise  
157 modeling process, eliminating the variables that did not reach statistical significance with p-  
158 value  $\leq 0.05$ . The following equation represents the models analyzed:

$$\text{Ln}(y_i) = b + \beta_j T_{ij} + \omega_k C_{ik} + \varepsilon_z E_{iz}$$



159

160 Where  $i$  represents each observation;  $y_i$ , the morbi-mortality data used;  $b$ , the intercept;  $\beta_j$ ,  
161 represents the coefficient calculated for wave  $T_{ij}$  and its lags  $j$ ;  $\omega_k$ , represents the coefficient  
162 calculated for each of the  $k$  control variables ( $C_{ik}$ ); and  $\varepsilon_z$  represents the coefficient calculated  
163 for each of the  $z$  environmental variables ( $E_{iz}$ ) considered in the model. A model was designed  
164 for each cause, age group and administrative level analyzed.

## 165 2.2 Analysis of the pattern of risks

166 The pattern of risks calculated during heat waves was analyzed using univariate and  
167 multivariate GLM models of the binomial family that use the logit function as link.

168 Detection of risk, defined Rheat, was used for the dependent variable, a dummy variable that  
169 adopts a dichotomous value for each observation, described as follows:

170 If  $RA > 0$  then Rheat = 1

171 If  $RA = 0$  then Rheat = 0

172 The contextual explanatory variables were the aggregated income per households, the  
173 population over age 65, the percentage of household without cooling systems and hectares of  
174 green zone, included in the following way:

- 175 - Net income per households by district: Expressed as thousands of euros per year and  
176 taken from Sanz Fernández et al. 2016 with available data between the years 2011 and  
177 2013 from the National Statistics Institute (Instituto Nacional de Estadística, 2015).
- 178 - Age groups: Based on the percentage of the population over age 65 by district –  
179 available in the open access database of the Statistics Institute of the Community of  
180 Madrid (Instituto de Estadística de la Comunidad de Madrid, 2020)– the following  
181 levels were considered: group 1 - if the percent of the population over 65 years old

182 was less than 25 percent (17.12%), group 2 if the same value was found between  
183 percentiles 25 and 75 (21.92%), and group 3 if the percent was above the 75th.

184 - Non-air-conditioned homes (%): percentage of homes without cooling systems by  
185 district in the year 2001, based on Sanz Fernández et al. 2016 and indicators collected  
186 by INE (Instituto Nacional de Estadística, 2001).

187 - Green zones per district (Ha): Calculated as the aggregated area of green zones,  
188 gardens, and historic and forest parks. Data available in the open data portal of  
189 Madrid, 2020.

190 These models were made with days that meet with the condition  $Theat > 0$ . The explanatory  
191 variables included were contrasted one by one and adjusted in the GLM models of the  
192 multivariate binomial family. The variables that did not reach statistical significance with a p-  
193 value  $\leq 0.05$  were withdrawn from the final model presented in the results. The equations that  
194 are presented here refer to the univariate and multivariate models analyzed, respectively:

$$\log\left(\frac{p}{p-1}\right) = b + b_i Ctxt_{ij}$$
$$\log\left(\frac{p}{p-1}\right) = b + \beta_1 R_j + \beta_{2z} GE_z + \beta_3 V_j + \beta NR_j$$

195 Where  $p$  represents the probability of detecting impact;  $b$ , the intercept of the model;  $\beta$   
196 represents the coefficient calculated for the context variable ( $Ctxt$ )  $i$  in the district  $j$ . These  
197 context variables were income ( $R$ ), age group  $z$  ( $GE$ ), green zone( $V$ ) and homes without access  
198 to cooling systems ( $NR$ ).

199 The free R software was employed for the construction and cleaning of the data, and STATA  
200 software version 14.2 was used to calculate the models.

201

202

203

204        **3. Results**

205        Table 1 shows basic descriptive statistics related to mortality in different districts in Madrid. It  
206        shows that mortality is similar in all of the districts with an average mortality that is double  
207        that of districts with lower mortality.

208        The descriptive statistics of the context variables used are shown in Table 2. It highlights the  
209        fact that in none of the districts in Madrid do cooling systems reach less than 50 percent of  
210        households. In contrast, there is a quite unequal distribution of green zones among districts,  
211        which drives a higher dispersion.

212        Figure 2 represents the geographical distribution of the districts in Madrid where the study  
213        was carried out. It shows that risks were detected in three of the analyzed districts: Tetuan,  
214        Carabanchel, and Puente de Vallecas. The values of these risks are shown in Table 3. In Tetuan  
215        and Puente de Vallecas there is an immediate impact of heat (lag 0), but in Carabanchel there  
216        is also a short-term effect (lag 2), although there are no statistically significant differences in  
217        terms of the values of these risks.

218        Table 4 shows the results of the regression models in terms of the response variable and the  
219        explanatory variables, considered one by one. Statistically significant differences can be  
220        observed for all of them except for age. Finally, Table 5 shows the results of the adjusted  
221        multivariate model.

222        The statistical association with income per household and access to air conditioning was  
223        maintained in the adjusted model. As income level increases, the probability of detecting a  
224        heat wave impact decreases in a statistically significant way. In the same way, as the  
225        percentage of homes without access to cooling increases in a given district, this probability  
226        increases.

227 As shown in Figure 3, income level per household tends to increase with the percentage of  
228 those over age 65 in the districts. This could explain why there are no statistically significant  
229 differences by age group in the univariate model. However, there is an association in the  
230 adjusted model. In the districts found in group 2—with intermediate percentages of vulnerable  
231 population— the probability of finding risk increases with respect to the reference group:  
232 those districts with less population at risk. The contrast between districts in group 3 and group  
233 1 could not be carried out, because there was no risk detected in any of the districts with  
234 more vulnerable populations.

235 Finally, after analyzing the relationship between the pattern of risk and the Ha of green zones  
236 found in each district, we observed that as green zones increase the probability of detecting  
237 heat impacts decreases in a statistically significant way. However, this effect disappears in the  
238 adjusted model.

239

#### 240 **4. Discussion**

241 The first notable result of this study is that heat impacted daily mortality in only three of the  
242 districts analyzed. This result is supported by other studies carried out in the city of Madrid  
243 (Díaz et al., 2015a), in Spain (Díaz et al., 2018) and in other countries (Barecca et al., 2016)  
244 which show that the effect of heat on mortality is clearly decreasing in recent years.

245 The role played by the population over age 65 on the impact of heat seems to be limited,  
246 despite being the age group with a greater incidence of heat (Díaz et al., 2002; Díaz et al.,  
247 2015a; Gronlund et al., 2016). In fact, this analysis did not detect a heat impact in any of the  
248 districts with the greatest percentage of population over age 65, which correspond to group 3.  
249 This result seems to contradict what has been found in other studies that established a direct  
250 relationship between the percentage of people over age 65 and a greater impact of heat  
251 (Montero et al., 2012). Therefore, it seems that there must be other factors that modulate the

252 effect of heat beyond those that are exclusively physiological. According to our results income  
253 level is a determinant factor in explaining this behavior, and this is shown in Tables 4 and 5, in  
254 which income is statistically significant both in the univariate model (Table 4) and the  
255 multivariate adjusted linear model (Table 5). The collinearity between the age group and the  
256 income level per household could explain this result. The results observed agree with prior  
257 studies that point to vulnerable populations bearing the burden of greater risks related to heat  
258 waves (Laverdière et al., 2016; Mushore et al., 2018; Phung et al., 2016).

259 Another factor that has been a source of controversy in recent studies is the role of air  
260 conditioning in the impact of heat on population health (Sheridan et al., 2018; Martínez et al.,  
261 2019). Some studies indicate that this is a determinant factor in modulating the impact of heat  
262 waves (Barreca et al. 2016; Fisk, 2015; Laurent et al., 2018). The results of our study confirm  
263 this hypothesis. It could be that this factor is directly related to income level, but the fact that  
264 in Table 5 both variables (income level and percentage with air conditioning) are significant  
265 could indicate that they explain different realities. Even when they have air conditioning units,  
266 low income people tend not to use them when they feel discomfort (Gao et al., 2020; Sánchez-  
267 Guevara et al., 2015; Núñez Peiró et al., 2017). The inability to cope with electricity  
268 consumption from air conditioning, even if the household has the equipment, is a little  
269 explored but potentially very relevant facet of energy poverty in the study of socio-economic  
270 factors of vulnerability to heat (Bouzarovski & Petrova, 2015; Lane et al., 2014). On the other  
271 hand, there are studies that show that living alone and with a low income (Sanz Fernández et  
272 al., 2016), is a factor that increases the risk of death during a heat wave (Lin et al., 2019; Zhang  
273 et al., 2017). Therefore, the level of income per household is a key social indicator of heat  
274 vulnerability that explains other related aspects such as loneliness and energy poverty. Also, it  
275 could be that families with lower incomes might lack the time and resources needed to  
276 guarantee sufficient levels of care to the population at risk. In contrast, families with greater

277 incomes could access services that offer additional compensatory compensation for the most  
278 vulnerable, such as health services or private assistance (Sanz Fernández et al., 2016).

279 Another factor that is indirectly related to income level is the percentage of green zones.  
280 Green zones play an important role in mitigating the heat island effect, by which  
281 temperatures, especially at night, can be several degrees higher in the interior of cities than in  
282 the periphery (Alonso and Renard, 2020; Heaviside et al., 2017; Sánchez-Guevara et al., 2019;  
283 ). On the other hand, green zones have the capacity to mitigate high temperatures, thanks to  
284 heat dissipation due to evapotranspiration of plants and the creation of shade (Burkart et al.,  
285 2016). This protective effect of green zones related to heat impact can be observed in Table 4  
286 of this study, which corresponds to the univariate model. The table shows that the probability  
287 of risk related to extreme heat events decreases as hectares of green zones increase. However,  
288 in Table 5, which shows the adjusted multivariate model, this variable loses statistical  
289 significance. This result agrees with the findings of a study in the city of Berlin, which showed  
290 that facades, rooftops and urban green zones do not necessarily lead to a statistically  
291 significant reduction in interior air temperature (Buchin et al., 2016a). In this sense, some  
292 studies have determined that interior air temperature of buildings are more intimately  
293 correlated with the presence of climatization systems and construction characteristics than  
294 with exterior temperatures (Loughnan et al., 2015; Lundgren et al., 2019). In this way the risks  
295 associated with heat waves could be better explained by factors related to interior air  
296 temperatures than exterior temperatures in cities (Buchin, et al. 2016b; Walikewitz, et al.  
297 2018). A previous paper reported a similar behavior between green zones and climatization  
298 systems (McDonald et al., 2020).

299 However, this does not imply that the role of green zones is not important or does not exist.  
300 Recently it has been shown that as homes install air conditioning systems, the association  
301 between green zones and heat mortality becomes weaker, and at the same time the

302 association between green zones and energy savings during heat waves becomes stronger  
303 (MacDonald et al., 2020). Therefore, the protective effect of green zones is reflected indirectly  
304 in terms of the greater need for energy to reach a comfortable temperature in the home. In  
305 addition, the presence of green zones reduces the levels of air pollution in cities (Rafael et al.,  
306 2020), and contribute to improved physical condition and mental health (Andreucci et al.,  
307 2019; Marchegguiani et al., 2019). Both factors contribute to population response to heat.

308 Finally, the lack of risk found for any district in group 3—in which those over age 65 tend to  
309 live—could be explained by this population’s income level. The average income per household  
310 in these districts (Figure 3) is above 50,000 net euros per year, which is well above average for  
311 the districts (38,770 net euros per year). Thus explained is the apparent contradiction  
312 between not finding risks in districts with a more vulnerable population thanks to the  
313 compensatory role of higher income per household, which allows for effectively protecting  
314 patients at risk of exposure to heat waves. In contrast, in the districts with lower income, this  
315 factor is important, for example, in not finding a heat wave effect in Villaverde or in the central  
316 district, despite having the lowest income levels, given that they simultaneously have lower  
317 populations over age 65.

318

319 This study has limitations, including those related to the nature of ecological studies. On one  
320 hand, the results of this type of study can only be applied at the population level and not at  
321 the individual level. Another possible limitation present in all of these studies is that  
322 meteorological variables are measured delocalized from the place in which exposure is  
323 produced, such that not necessarily all of the population analyzed is really exposed to the  
324 temperatures they’ve been assigned. Moreover, the possible temperature differences  
325 between the centre and the urban periphery caused by the heat island effect, given that this is  
326 a night-time phenomenon, should not be too far-reaching in this respect. Furthermore, it

327 should be noted that the environment in which the measuring stations are located is very  
328 different from that of the urban fabric (Núñez Peiró, et al. 2019). However, these problems are  
329 common among this type of study (Samet et al., 2000), and they are minimized by including  
330 control variables in the generalized linear models carried out to calculate risks (Ingebrigtsen et  
331 al., 2015). The use of stepwise methods to specify the models are in danger of omitting  
332 explanatory variables that, although relevant, would not be statistically significant due to  
333 collinearity. If these were so, a specification error would occur, leading to biased estimators.

334 This study did not control for air pollution due to the lack of available data at this level of  
335 disaggregation. In this sense, it should be noted that the role of air pollution in relation to the  
336 impact of heat daily mortality is relatively small (Díaz et al., 2015b). Finally, there is the  
337 limitation of finding effect in only 3 of 17 analyzed districts, which would affect the statistical  
338 significance of the associations found in Tables 4 and 5. Finally, the data used for air  
339 conditioning were collected in 2001, nine years before the starting date of the time series of  
340 the mortality data. However, there are no more updated data.

341 In summary, the pattern of risks found in this study is explained primarily by income per  
342 household, such that in those districts with greater income levels people tend to have the  
343 means to compensate for or avoid heat waves, which does not happen in lower income  
344 districts, where risks are more likely. Evidently, an important factor that is conditioned by  
345 income level is the access to cooling systems, but it is not the only factor. Among the districts  
346 where income levels do not permit compensating for the exposure, we did find that the role of  
347 the population at risk is important, and that detecting an impact among the younger  
348 population is less probable. Finally, although green zones mitigate the impact of heat waves,  
349 their role is not more determinant than that of income level or air conditioning in homes. In  
350 general, we can confirm that the impact of climate change is more accentuated among  
351 marginalized social groups (Rossati, et al., 2017).



352 The socioeconomic factors together with the age of the population are the key factors to  
353 explain the different heat impact detected in the districts of Madrid City. Public policies that  
354 aim to urban regeneration to guarantee a minimum thermal habitability conditions in a passive  
355 way, as well as the development of urban green, together with others aimed at guaranteeing  
356 access to suitable air-conditioning systems, would make it possible to maintain comfortable  
357 temperatures by optimising energy consumption and achieving a significant reduction in the  
358 excess mortality attributable to the cold.

## 359 5. Acknowledgements

360 The authors are grateful for the contribution of Madrid Salud, for providing the mortality data  
361 that have served as a basis for the development of this paper.

362 In addition, his research was funded by the Municipal Consumption Institute of the Madrid City  
363 Council and the FEMENMAD project – “Feminización de la pobreza energética en Madrid.  
364 Exposición a extremos térmicos” – funded by the Madrid City Council under the call  
365 “Subvenciones 2018 para la realización de proyectos de investigación en materia de  
366 ciudadanía global y cooperación internacional para el Desarrollo”.

367

## 368 6. Disclaimer

369 The researchers declare that they have no conflict of interest that would compromise the  
370 independence of this research work. The views expressed by the authors do not necessarily  
371 coincide with those of the institutions whose affiliation is indicated at the beginning.

372

## 373 7. References.

- 374 ● Alberdi JC, Díaz J. Modelización de la mortalidad diaria en la Comunidad de Madrid de  
375 1986 a 1991. Gaceta Sanitaria. 1997;11:9-15.

- 376 ● Alonso L, Renard F. A (2020). Comparative Study of the Physiological and Socio-  
377 Economic Vulnerabilities to Heat Waves of the Population of the Metropolis of Lyon  
378 (France) in a Climate Change Context. *Int J Environ Res Public Health*.5:17(3)
- 379 ● Andreucci, M. B., Russo, A., & Olszewska-Guizzo, A. (2019). Designing Urban Green  
380 Blue Infrastructure for Mental Health and Elderly Wellbeing. *Sustainability*, 11(22),  
381 6425.
- 382 ● Åström, D. O., Tornevi, A., Ebi, K. L., Rocklöv, J., & Forsberg, B. (2016). Evolution of  
383 minimum mortality temperature in Stockholm, Sweden, 1901–2009. *Environ Health*  
384 *Perspect* 124(6), 740-744.
- 385 ● Åström, D. O., Ebi, K. L., Vicedo-Cabrera, A. M., & Gasparrini, A. (2018). Investigating  
386 changes in mortality attributable to heat and cold in Stockholm, Sweden. *Int J*  
387 *Biometeorol* 62(9), 1777-1780.
- 388 ● Barreca, A., Clay, K., Deschenes, O., Greenstone, M., & Shapiro, J. S. (2016). Adapting  
389 to climate change: The remarkable decline in the US temperature-mortality  
390 relationship over the twentieth century. *J Political Econ* 124(1), 105-159.
- 391 ● Bobb, J. F., Peng, R. D., Bell, M. L., & Dominici, F.(2014). Heat-related mortality} and  
392 adaptation to heat in the United States. *Environ Health Perspect*. 122(8), 811–816.
- 393 ● Bouzarovski, S., & Petrova, S. (2015). A global perspective on domestic energy  
394 deprivation: Overcoming the energy poverty–fuel poverty binary. *Energy Research &*  
395 *Social Science*, 10, 31–40. <https://doi.org/10.1016/J.ERSS.2015.06.007>
- 396 ● Bowler, D. E., Buyung-Ali, L., Knight, T. M., & Pullin, A. S. (2010). Urban greening to cool  
397 towns and cities: A systematic review of the empirical evidence. *Lands Urb Plan* 97(3),  
398 147-155.
- 399 ● Buchin, O., Hoelscher, M. T., Meier, F., Nehls, T., & Ziegler, F. (2016a). Evaluation of the  
400 health-risk reduction potential of countermeasures to urban heat islands. *Ener*  
401 *Buildings*, 114, 27-37.

- 402 ● Buchin, O., Jänicke, B., Meier, F., Scherer, D., & Ziegler, F. (2016b). The role of building  
403 models in the evaluation of heat-related risks. *Nat Haz & Earth Syst Sciences*, 16(4).
- 404 ● Burkart K, Meier F, Schneider A, Breitner S, Canário P, Alcoforado MJ, Scherer D,  
405 Endlicher W. (2016). Modification of heat-related mortality in an elderly urban  
406 population by vegetation (urban green) and proximity to water (urban blue): evidence  
407 from Lisbon, Portugal. *Environ Health Perspect* 124(7), 927-934.
- 408 ● Carmona R, Linares C, Ortiz C, Mirón IJ, Luna MY, Díaz J. (2017). Spatial variability in  
409 threshold temperatures of heat wave mortality: impact assessment on prevention  
410 plans. *Int J Environ Health Res.* 27(6):463-475.
- 411 ● Chung, Y., Noh, H., Honda, Y., Hashizume, M., Bell, M. L., Guo, Y. L. L., & Kim, H. (2017).  
412 Temporal changes in mortality related to extreme temperatures for 15 cities in  
413 Northeast Asia: adaptation to heat and maladaptation to cold. *Am J*  
414 *Epidemiol*, 185(10), 907-913.
- 415 ● Coste J, Spira A (1991). Le proportion de cas attribuable en Santé Publique:  
416 definition(s),estimation(s) et interpretation. *Rev. Epidemiol. Sante Publique* 51, 399–  
417 411.
- 418 ● Díaz J, López C, Jordán A, Alberdi JC, García R, Hernández E, Otero A. (2002). Heat  
419 waves in Madrid, 1986-1997: effects on the health of the elderly. *Int Arch Occup*  
420 *Environ Health*.2002; 75:163-170.
- 421 ● Díaz J, Carmona R, Mirón IJ, Ortiz C, Linares C. (2015a). Comparison of the effects of  
422 extreme temperatures on daily mortality in Madrid (Spain), by age group: The need for  
423 a cold wave prevention plan. *Environ Res*.Nov;143 (Pt A):186-91.
- 424 ● Díaz J, Carmona R, Mirón IJ, Ortiz C, León I, Linares C (2015b). Geographical variation in  
425 relative risks associated with heat: Update of Spain's Heat Wave Prevention Plan.  
426 *Environ Int.* 85:273-83.

- 427 ● Díaz J, Carmona R, Mirón IJ, Luna MY, Linares C (2018). Time trend in the impact of  
 428 heat waves on daily mortality in Spain for a period of over thirty years (1983-2013).  
 429 Environ Int 116:10-17.
- 430 ● Díaz, J., Sáez, M., Carmona, R., Mirón, I. J., Barceló, M. A., Luna, M. Y., & Linares, C.  
 431 (2019). Mortality attributable to high temperatures over the 2021–2050 and 2051–  
 432 2100 time horizons in Spain: Adaptation and economic estimate. Environ Res 172, 475-  
 433 485.
- 434 ● Ebi KL, Rocklöv J. (2014). Climate change and health modeling: horses for courses. Glob  
 435 Health Action 7:24154.
- 436 ● Fisk, W. J. (2015). Review of some effects of climate change on indoor environmental  
 437 quality and health and associated no-regrets mitigation measures. Build Environ 86,  
 438 70-80.
- 439 ● Follos F, Linares C, Vellón JM, López-Bueno JA, Luna MY, Sánchez-Martínez G, Díaz J  
 440 (2020). The Evolution of Minimum Mortality Temperatures as an Indicator of Heat  
 441 Adaptation: The Cases of Madrid and Seville (Spain). Sci Tot Environ. In press.
- 442 ● Gasparrini A., Guo Y., Hashizume M., Lavigne E., Zanobetti A., Schwartz J., Tobias A.,  
 443 Tong S., Rocklöv J., Forsberg B., Leone M., De Sario M., Bell ML10., Guo Y.L., Wu C.F.,  
 444 Kan H., Yi S.M., de Sousa M., Saldiva P.H., Honda Y., Kim H., Armstrong B. (2015).  
 445 Mortality risk attributable to high and low ambient temperature: a multicountry  
 446 observational study. The Lancet, 386(9991), 369-375.
- 447 ● Gao, Y., Chan, E. Y., Lam, H. C., & Wang, A. (2020). Perception of Potential Health Risk  
 448 of Climate Change and Utilization of Fans and Air Conditioners in a Representative  
 449 Population of Hong Kong. International J Dis Risk Sc, 1-14.
- 450 ● Guirguis, K., Basu, R., Al-Delaimy, W. K., Benmarhnia, T., Clemesha, R. E., Corcos, I.,  
 451 Guzman-Morales J., Hailey B., Small I., Tardy A., Vashishtha D., Zivin J.G. & Gershunov

- 452 A., (2018).Heat, Disparities, and Health Outcomes in San Diego County's Diverse  
453 Climate Zones. *Geo Health*, 2(7), 212-223.
- 454 ● Guo Y., Gasparrini A., Li S., Sera F., Vicedo-Cabrera A.M., de Sousa M., Saldiva PHN, et  
455 al (2018). Quantifying excess deaths related to heatwaves under climate change  
456 scenarios: A multicountry time series modelling study. *PLoS Med.*15(7):e1002629.
  - 457 ● Gronlund, C. J., Zanobetti, A., Wellenius, G. A., Schwartz, J. D., & O'Neill, M. S. (2016).  
458 Vulnerability to renal, heat and respiratory hospitalizations during extreme heat  
459 among US elderly. *Clim Change*, 136(3-4), 631-645.
  - 460 ● Heaviside C, Macintyre H, Vardoulakis S (2017). The Urban Heat Island: Implications for  
461 Health in a Changing Environment. *Curr Environ Health Rep.*4: 296-305
  - 462 ● Instituto de Estadística de la Comunidad de Madrid (2020) Accessed at:  
463 [http://www.madrid.org/iestadis/fijas/estructu/demograficas/padron/estructupcrd.ht](http://www.madrid.org/iestadis/fijas/estructu/demograficas/padron/estructupcrd.htm)  
464 [m](http://www.madrid.org/iestadis/fijas/estructu/demograficas/padron/estructupcrd.htm)
  - 465 ● Instituto Nacional de estadística, 2001. Censos de Población y Vivienda 2001.  
466 Resultados definitivos. Accessed at: <https://www.ine.es/censo/es/inicio.jsp>
  - 467 ● Instituto Nacional de Estadística, 2015. Urban Audit Complete Methodology Report.  
468 Accessed at: [https://ec.europa.eu/eurostat/web/products-manuals-and-guidelines/-](https://ec.europa.eu/eurostat/web/products-manuals-and-guidelines/-/KS-BD-04-002?inheritRedirect=true)  
469 [/KS-BD-04-002?inheritRedirect=true](https://ec.europa.eu/eurostat/web/products-manuals-and-guidelines/-/KS-BD-04-002?inheritRedirect=true)
  - 470 ● Ingebrigtsen, R., Steinsland, I., Cirera, L1., Saez, M (2015). Spatially misaligned data and  
471 the impact of monitoring network on health effect estimates (Doctoral thesis at  
472 NTNU).In: Ingebrigtsen, R. (Ed.), *Bayesian Spatial Modelling of Non-stationary*  
473 *Processes and Misaligned Data Utilising Markov Properties for Computational*  
474 *Efficiency*. Norwegian University of Science and Technology.
  - 475 ● IPCC, (2013): *Climate Change 2013: The Physical Science Basis*. Contribution of  
476 Working Group I to the Fifth Assessment Report of the Intergovernmental Panel on  
477 Climate Change [Stocker, T. F., D. Qin, G. K. Plattner, M. Tignor, S. K. Allen, J. Boschung,

- 478 A. Nauels, Y. Xia, V. Bex and P. M. Midgley (eds.)). Cambridge University Press,  
479 Cambridge, United Kingdom and New York, NY, USA, 1535 pp. Accessed at:  
480 <http://www.ipcc.ch/report/ar5/2>.
- 481 ● Lane, K., Wheeler, K., Charles-Guzman, K., Ahmed, M., Blum, M., Gregory, K., Graber,  
482 N; Clark, N; Matte, T. (2014). Extreme Heat Awareness and Protective Behaviors in  
483 New York City. *Journal of Urban Health*, 91(3), 403–414. Accessed at:  
484 <https://doi.org/10.1007/s11524-013-9850-7>
  - 485 ● Laurent, J. G. C., Williams, A., Oulhote, Y., Zanobetti, A., Allen, J. G., & Spengler, J. D.  
486 (2018). Reduced cognitive function during a heat wave among residents of non-air-  
487 conditioned buildings: An observational study of young adults in the summer of  
488 2016. *PLoS Med*, 15(7), e1002605.
  - 489 ● Laverdière, É., Payette, H., Gaudreau, P., Morais, J. A., Shatenstein, B., & Généreux, M.  
490 (2016). Risk and protective factors for heat-related events among older adults of  
491 Southern Quebec (Canada): The NuAge study. *Canad J Pub Health*, 107(3), e258-e265.
  - 492 ● Lee, H., Mayer, H., & Chen, L. (2016). Contribution of trees and grasslands to the  
493 mitigation of human heat stress in a residential district of Freiburg, Southwest  
494 Germany. *Lands Urb Plann* 148, 37-50.
  - 495 ● Lin, Y. K., Maharani, A. T., Chang, F. T., & Wang, Y. C. (2019). Mortality and morbidity  
496 associated with ambient temperatures in Taiwan. *Sci Tot Environ* 651, 210-217.
  - 497 ● Linares, C., Sánchez, R., Mirón, I. J., & Díaz, J. (2015). Has there been a decrease in  
498 mortality due to heat waves in Spain? Findings from a multicity case study. *J Integr*  
499 *Environ Sciences*, 12(2), 153-163.
  - 500 ● Linares C, Martinez-Martin P, Rodríguez-Blázquez C, Forjaz MJ, Carmona R, Díaz J  
501 (2016). Effect of heat waves on morbidity and mortality due to Parkinson's disease in  
502 Madrid: A time-series analysis. *Environ Int*;89-90:1-6

- 503 ● Linares C, Díaz J, Negev M, Sánchez-Martínez G, Debono R, Paz S (2020). Impacts of  
504 Climate Change on the Public Health of the Mediterranean Basin Population - Current  
505 Situation, Projections, Preparedness and Adaptation. *Environ Res.* 182 .109107.
- 506 ● López-Bueno, J. A., Díaz, J., & Linares, C. (2019). Differences in the impact of heat  
507 waves according to urban and peri-urban factors in Madrid. *Int J Biometeorol* 63(3),  
508 371-380.
- 509 ● Loughnan, M., Carroll, M., & Tapper, N. J. (2015). The relationship between housing  
510 and heat wave resilience in older people. *Int J Biometeorol*, 59(9), 1291-1298.
- 511 ● Lundgren Kownacki, K., Gao, C., Kuklane, K., & Wierzbicka, A. (2019). Heat stress in  
512 Indoor environments of Scandinavian urban areas: A literature review. *Int J Environ*  
513 *Res Pub Health*, 16(4), 560.
- 514 ● Marcheggiani, S., Tinti, D., Puccinelli, C., & Mancini, L. (2019). Urban green space and  
515 healthy living: an exploratory study among Appia Antica parks users (Rome-Italy). *Feb-*  
516 *Fresenius Environ Bull*, 4984.
- 517 ● Martínez GS, Linares C, Ayuso A, Kendrovski V, Boeckmann M, Díaz J. (2019). Heat-  
518 Health Action Plans in Europe: challenges ahead and how to tackle them. *Environ Res*  
519 176:108548.
- 520 ● McDonald, R. I., Kroeger, T., Zhang, P., & Hamel, P. (2020). The value of US urban tree  
521 cover for reducing heat-related health impacts and electricity  
522 consumption. *Ecosystems*, 23(1), 137-150.
- 523 ● Miron IJ, Linares C, Montero JC, Criado-Alvarez JJ, Díaz J., (2015). Changes in cause-  
524 specific mortality during heat waves in central Spain, 1975-2008. *Int J Biometeorol*  
525 59(9):1213-22.
- 526 ● Miron, I. J., Criado-Alvarez, J. J., Diaz, J., Linares, C., Mayoral, S., & Montero, J. C.  
527 (2008). Time trends in minimum mortality temperatures in Castile-La Mancha (Central  
528 Spain): 1975–2003. *Int J Biometeorol*, 52(4), 291-299.

- 529 ● Montero, J.C., Miron, I.J., Criado-Alvarez, J.J., Linares, C., Diaz, J., (2012). Influence of  
530 local factors in the relationship between mortality and heat waves: castile-La Mancha  
531 (1975-2003). *Sci. Total Environ.* 414, 73–80.
- 532 ● Mushore, T. D., Mutanga, O., Odindi, J., & Dube, T. (2018). Determining extreme heat  
533 vulnerability of Harare Metropolitan City using multispectral remote sensing and socio-  
534 economic data. *J Spat Sci* 63(1), 173-191.
- 535 ● Norton, B. A., Coutts, A. M., Livesley, S. J., Harris, R. J., Hunter, A. M., & Williams, N. S.  
536 (2015). Planning for cooler cities: A framework to prioritise green infrastructure to  
537 mitigate high temperatures in urban landscapes. *Lands Urb Plann* 134, 127-138.
- 538 ● Núñez Peiró, M., Sánchez-Guevara Sánchez, C., & Neila González, F. J. (2017). Update  
539 of the urban heat island of Madrid and its influence on the building's energy  
540 simulation. *Sustainable development and renovation in architecture, urbanism and  
541 engineering* (pp. 339-350) doi:10.1007/978-3-319-51442-0\_28
- 542 ● Núñez Peiró, M., Sánchez-Guevara Sánchez, C., & Neila González, F. J. (2019). Source  
543 area definition for local climate zones studies. A systematic review. *Building and  
544 Environment*, 148, 258-285. doi:10.1016/j.buildenv.2018.10.050
- 545 ● Portal de datos abiertos del Ayuntamiento de Madrid (2020). Accessed at:  
546 [https://datos.madrid.es/portal/site/egob/menuitem.c05c1f754a33a9fbe4b2e4b284f1  
547 a5a0/?vgnextoid=559b401daf436610VgnVCM1000001d4a900aRCRD&vgnnextchannel=  
548 374512b9ace9f310VgnVCM100000171f5a0aRCRD&vgnnextfmt=default](https://datos.madrid.es/portal/site/egob/menuitem.c05c1f754a33a9fbe4b2e4b284f1a5a0/?vgnextoid=559b401daf436610VgnVCM1000001d4a900aRCRD&vgnnextchannel=374512b9ace9f310VgnVCM100000171f5a0aRCRD&vgnnextfmt=default)
- 549 ● Phung, D., Guo, Y., Nguyen, H. T., Rutherford, S., Baum, S., & Chu, C. (2016). High  
550 temperature and risk of hospitalizations, and effect modifying potential of socio-  
551 economic conditions: A multi-province study in the tropical Mekong Delta  
552 Region. *Environ Int*, 92, 77-86.



- 553 ● Rafael, S., Augusto, B., Ascenso, A., Borrego, C., & Miranda, A. I. (2020). Re-Naturing  
554 Cities: Evaluating the effects on future air quality in the city of Porto. *Atm Environ*, 222,  
555 117123.
- 556 ● Rossati, A. (2017). Global warming and its health impact. *Int J Occup Environ*  
557 *Med*, 8(1), 7.
- 558 ● Sánchez-Guevara, C., Sanz Fernández, A., Hernández Aja, A., 2015. Income, energy  
559 expenditure and housing in Madrid: retrofitting policy implications. *Build. Res. Inf.* 43,  
560 737–749. doi:10.1080/09613218.2014.984573
- 561 ● Sánchez-Guevara, C., Núñez Peiró, M., Taylor, J., Mavrogianni, A., Neila González, F.J.,  
562 2019. Assessing population vulnerability towards summer energy poverty: Case studies  
563 of Madrid and London. *Energy Build.* 190, 132–143. doi:10.1016/j.enbuild.2019.02.024
- 564 ● Samet, J., Dominici, F., Zeger, S., Schwartz, J., Dockery, D., 2000. The National  
565 Morbidity, Mortality and Air Pollution Study. Part I: Methods and Methodologic Issues.  
566 Health Effects Institute, Boston. Report No. 94.
- 567 ● Sanz Fernández, A., Gómez Muñoz, G., Sánchez-Guevara, C., & Núñez Peiró, M. (2016).  
568 Estudio técnico sobre pobreza energética en la ciudad de Madrid.
- 569 ● Sheridan, S.C., Allen, M.J., (2018). Temporal Trends in human vulnerability to  
570 excessive heat. *Environ Res Letters*3.
- 571 ● Trombly, J., Chalupka, S., & Anderko, L. (2017). Climate change and mental  
572 health. *AJN Am J Nurs* 117(4), 44-52.
- 573 ● Walikewitz, N., Jänicke, B., Langner, M., & Endlicher, W. (2018). Assessment of indoor  
574 heat stress variability in summer and during heat warnings: a case study using the UTCI  
575 in Berlin, Germany. *Int J Biometeorol* 62(1), 29-42.
- 576 ● Wang, Y., Bobb, J. F., Papi, B., Wang, Y., Kosheleva, A., Di, Q., Di Q., Schwartz JD.,  
577 Dominici F. (2016). Heat stroke admissions during heat waves in 1,916 US counties for  
578 the period from 1999 to 2010 and their effect modifiers. *Environ Health*, 15(1), 1-9.

- 579 ● Ward, K., Lauf, S., Kleinschmit, B., & Endlicher, W. (2016). Heat waves and urban heat  
580 islands in Europe: A review of relevant drivers. *Sci Tot Environ*, 569, 527-539.
- 581 ● Willand, N., Ridley, I., & Pears, A. (2016). Relationship of thermal performance rating,  
582 summer indoor temperatures and cooling energy use in 107 homes in Melbourne,  
583 Australia. *Ener Build*, 113, 159-168.
- 584 ● WMO (2019). World Meteorological Organization. *The Global Climate in 2015–2019*.  
585 Geneve. 2019
- 586 ● Zhang, Y., Nitschke, M., Krackowizer, A., Dear, K., Pisaniello, D., Weinstein, P., Tucker  
587 G., Shakib S., Bi P. (2017). Risk factors for deaths during the 2009 heat wave in  
588 Adelaide, Australia: a matched case-control study. *Int J Biometeorol* 61(1), 35-47.
- 589